# Bibliography on Addressing Hate Crimes and Victims' Rights

## **Policies, Manuals, and Guides**

#### **Canadian Publications**

### Law Enforcement and Prosecution Manuals

This section is compiled of informative and instructive materials that address the policing and prosecution standards of hate crimes in Canada. These publications also review reported statistics, methods, and policies utilized by different agencies and provide insight into current practices.

British Columbia Prosecution Service. (2021). Crown counsel policy manual. <a href="https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/law-crime-and-justice/criminal-justice/prosecution-service/crown-counsel-policy-manual/hat-1.pdf">https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/law-crime-and-justice/criminal-justice/prosecution-service/crown-counsel-policy-manual/hat-1.pdf</a>

Provincial prosecution manual that provides a legal definition of hate crime, relevant offence charges, and public interest factors that favour the prosecution of hate crime in British Columbia. Includes reference to hate motivation as an aggravating factor for prosecution, Attorney General consent, and victim impact statements.

Ottawa Police Service. (2021). *Hate motivated incidents*. <a href="https://www.ottawapolice.ca/en/safety-and-crime-prevention/hate-motivated-incidents.aspx">https://www.ottawapolice.ca/en/safety-and-crime-prevention/hate-motivated-incidents.aspx</a>

Webpage article that discusses the evolving nature of hate-motivated incidents and the steps being taken to improve police responses to these incidents in Canada. The OPS highlights their three-pronged approach to hate crimes that includes investigative responses, community outreach, and the gathering of intelligence.

Poynting, S. (2018). Schweppe, J & Walters, M. (eds). (2016). The globalization of hate: Internationalizing hate crime. *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 7(2), 107–109. https://doi.org/10.5204/ijcjsd.v7i2.530

This book review discusses key challenges in conceptualizing and combating hate crime and the contrasting punitive and preventive measures of policy practice. The review seeks to resolve apparent discrepancies in the book "The Globalization of Hate: Internationalizing Hate Crime" and provide an analysis of key themes.

Thompson, S., Ismail, F., & Couto, J. (2020). *Hate/bias crime: A review of policies, practices and challenges*. Ontario Association of Chiefs of Police. <a href="https://www.oacp.ca/en/current-issues/hate-crime.aspx">https://www.oacp.ca/en/current-issues/hate-crime.aspx</a>

Comprehensive guidebook/report that overviews current police policies, practices, and challenges to assist law enforcement services in producing more effective intervention strategies in the policing of hate crimes.

Toronto Police Service Hate Crime Unit. (2019). *Annual hate crime statistical report*. http://www.torontopolice.on.ca/publications/files/reports/2019hatecrimereport.pdf

Annual report from the Toronto Police Services specialized hate crime unit. This report includes statistics about hate crime offences dealt with by the department, patterns of hate motivated offenders, commonly victimized groups, suspect identification, charges, sentencing, population/demographics, and education and community outreach initiatives.

### Judiciary Reviews

This section is compiled of materials that are provided by, and/or review, judicial decisions and the implementation of legal provisions on hate crimes in Canada. Publications include law reviews and a discussion of relevant legal publications.

Freiman, M. (2013). Hate speech and the reasonable Supreme Court of Canada. *The Supreme Court Law Review: Osgoode's Annual Constitutional Cases Conference 63* (12). https://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1271&context=sclr

Article discussing the Supreme Court of Canada's decisions regarding hate speech and their interpretation of reasonable limits when referencing the Charter and Criminal Code. Includes discussions of the legal definition of the word "hate", its subjectivity, and the imprecise implications of this definition.

Scharfstein, L. (2019). The hate speech debate: The Supreme Court, the federal government, and the need for civil hate speech provisions. *Asper Review of International Business and Trade Law 375*.

https://www.canlii.org/en/commentary/doc/2019CanLIIDocs4088#!fragment/zoupio-Toc3Page2/BQCwhgziBcwMYgK4DsDWszIQewE4BUBTADwBdoAvbRABwEtsBaAf X2zgGYAFMAc0IBMASgA0ybKUIQAiokK4AntADkykREJhcCWfKWr1m7SADKeUg CElAJQCiAGVsA1AIIA5AMK2RpMACNoUnYhISA

This review discusses the conflicting nature of the fundamental Charter right to freedom of expression that is guaranteed, but not absolute. Scharfstein seeks to address the constitutional balancing act between the protection of vulnerable groups and maintaining the right to express oneself.

Walker, J. (2018). *Hate speech and freedom of expression: Legal boundaries in Canada*. (Publication No. 2018-25-E). Library of Parliament. <a href="https://bdp.parl.ca/staticfiles/PublicWebsite/Home/ResearchPublications/BackgroundPapers/PDF/2018-25-E.pdf">https://bdp.parl.ca/staticfiles/PublicWebsite/Home/ResearchPublications/BackgroundPapers/PDF/2018-25-E.pdf</a>

Background paper that discusses current legal boundaries of hate speech in relation to freedom of expression according to article 10 of the UN Universal declaration on Human Rights, the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, and specific Criminal Code provisions. This paper addresses current debates about anti-hate provisions in human rights legislation, discusses the controversy of freedom of expression and emphasizes the growing interest in this topic

### Government Agency Publications

This section is compiled of Government materials that discuss hate crime and speech in Canada. The publications include proposed legislation, as well as reports providing official statistics on the prevalence of these issues.

Government of Canada. (2015, January 7). *Disproportionate harm: Hate crime in Canada*. <a href="https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/csj-sjc/crime/wd95\_11-dt95\_11/p0\_1.html">https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/csj-sjc/crime/wd95\_11-dt95\_11/p0\_1.html</a>

This report provides collective documentation of the incidence of hate crimes in Canada and information about the classification of hate crimes across different provinces and police services. It discusses the impact of under-reporting and how hate crime victimization differs across different communities.

Government of Canada. (2021, September 1). Combating hate speech and hate crimes: Proposed legislative changes to the Canadian Human Rights Act and the Criminal Code. <a href="https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/csj-sjc/pl/chshc-lcdch/index.html">https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/csj-sjc/pl/chshc-lcdch/index.html</a>

Article that discusses proposed changes to the CHRA regarding online hate speech communications. It highlights exactly how hate speech would be defined in accordance with Supreme Court of Canada decisions and how this legal definition change would improve current hate speech procedures for complaints.

Canada, Parliament, House of Commons. Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights. (2019). *Taking action to end online hate*. 42nd Parl., 1st sess. Rept. 29. <a href="https://www.ourcommons.ca/Content/Committee/421/JUST/Reports/RP10581008/justrp29/justrp29-e.pdf">https://www.ourcommons.ca/Content/Committee/421/JUST/Reports/RP10581008/justrp29/justrp29-e.pdf</a>

This report addresses both hate speech and hate crimes in Canada and provides an analysis of online platforms, Charter protections, and available data about online hate crimes. It summarizes recommendations for consideration and provides an in-depth discussion of current hate crime legislation. A table summarizing offences specific to hate crimes in the Criminal Code can be found on page 14.

Moreau, G. (2020). *Police-reported hate crime in Canada-2018*. Statistics Canada. <a href="https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/85-002-x/2020001/article/00003-eng.pdf?st=7hly8Qbc">https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/85-002-x/2020001/article/00003-eng.pdf?st=7hly8Qbc</a>

This is a summary of police-reported hate crime in Canada and the major themes and patterns present in the research from 2018. The report includes a discussion of Canada's diverse population and the prevalence of different *types* of hate crimes in different communities.

#### **Association Articles**

This section is compiled of materials from various Canadian organizations that discuss and address hate crime policy, research and practices. Publications include policy and law reviews, journals, and position papers from a variety of agencies.

Action Chinese Canadians Together Foundation, & ACT2endracism. (2021). *Hate crimes and hate incidents*. Formatted reports from APPN - Google Drive.

This report identifies the recent increase of anti-Asian racism in Canada due to the COVID-19 pandemic, but also highlights that it has remained embedded in Canadian history long before that. The report offers a brief literature review as well as recent statistics regarding racism and hate against Asian-Canadians, and offers several policy recommendations based on their consultations.

Action Chinese Canadians Together Foundation, & ACT2endracism. (2021). Systemic racism in policing. Formatted reports from APPN - Google Drive

This report highlights that anti-Asian racism is prevalent among law enforcement agencies, and that civilian oversight boards are failing to hold these agencies accountable in Canada. The report offers a brief literature review as well as qualitative accounts of negative experiences with law enforcement among Asian-Canadians. The organizations offer several policy recommendations based on their consultations.

Ashley, F. (2018). Don't be so hateful: The insufficiency of anti-discrimination and hate crime laws in improving trans well-being. *University of Toronto Law Journal*, 68(1), 1–36. https://doi.org/10.3138/utlj.2017-0057

Article examines the judicial protection of trans individuals through anti-discrimination and hate crime laws that are designed specifically to mitigate anti-trans harassment, discrimination, and violence. Discusses the addition of gender identity and expression to Bill C-16 and the practical implications of hate crime laws to victims.

Bryan, T., & Trickett, L. (2021). "It's not really hate crime" - Reframing hate crime as not police business' - Police narratives of resistance and denial. *Journal of Hate Studies*, 17(1), 74. http://doi.org/10.33972/jhs.206

This article examines the gap between police policy and practices on hate crime among police forces in Canada and the UK. Findings indicate that police officers' interpretation of hate crimes is often from a policing lens rather than a victim lens, and that they often fail to understand how hate crimes affect individuals and their communities.

Chaudhry, I. (2021). Making hate visible: Online hate incident reporting tools. *Journal of Hate Studies*, 17(1), 64. <a href="http://doi.org/10.33972/jhs.188">http://doi.org/10.33972/jhs.188</a>

This article discusses the StopHateAB.ca website, an initiative of the Alberta Hate Crimes Committee, which was piloted in 2017 and discusses the importance of having alternative reporting platforms outside of law enforcement and government databases. Official and non-governmental data related to hate-based incidents is argues to help facilitate reporting of such incidents, and allow researchers to solidify more statistics about the prevalence of these incidents in Canada

Gill, L. (2020). *The legal aspects of hate speech in Canada*. Public Policy Forum. <a href="https://ppforum.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/1.DemX\_LegalAspects-EN.pdf">https://ppforum.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/1.DemX\_LegalAspects-EN.pdf</a>

Research report that identifies key legislative provisions related to hate speech, freedom of expression and reasonable limits and also highlights the current restrictions placed on hate speech by the Charter. The report evaluates specific case examples and concludes with a discussion of emerging new challenges around addressing hate speech in Canada.

Meyers, S. (2019). Is there a gap in Canada's hate crime laws? The identification of soft violence as a tool for current right-wing extremist social movements. *The Journal of Intelligence*, *Conflict, and Warfare* (2)(2). 1-13.

https://journals.lib.sfu.ca/index.php/jicw/article/download/1060/681

This article discusses the notion of soft violence (i.e.the use of culturally specific symbols and language) in Canada to analyze the effectiveness of current hate crime laws in Canada. It seeks to understand the influence of right wing extremist actors during the Trump era on hate crime and the marginalization of groups in Canada.

Organization for the Prevention of Violence. (2019). Responding to hate crimes and incidents in Canada.

 $\underline{https://www.ourcommons.ca/Content/Committee/421/JUST/Brief/BR10536925/brexternal/OrganizationForThePreventionOfViolence-e.pdf}$ 

Document summarizing research from the OPV on the experiences of hate crime victimization in Alberta, Canada. Includes first-hand testimonials of individuals, families and communities who have experienced hate crime in Canada and identifies significant gaps in current local and national responses to hate crime.

Perry, B. (2015). Disrupting the mantra of multiculturalism: Hate crime in Canada. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 59(13), 1637–1654. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764215588816

Article that discusses multiculturalism in Canada and assesses how bias-motivated crimes contrast Canada's claims of embracing diversity and inclusivity. Evaluates how the rhetoric of multiculturalism can still provide a foundation for future discourse that is inspired by an understanding of victimization.

### **Publications Outside of Canada**

### Legal Manuals and Guides

This section is compiled of informative and instructive materials that address the policing and prosecution standards of hate crimes outside of Canada. These publications also review reported statistics, methods, and policies utilized by different agencies and provide insight into current practices.

Goodall, K. & Walters, M. (2019). Legislating to address hate crimes against the LGBT community in the commonwealth. Technical Report, Human Dignity Trust. https://ssrn.com/abstract=3427983

Report that was commissioned by the Human Dignity Trust, and provides an analysis of hate crime laws enacted in the Commonwealth that are being used to counter violence and hate that LGBTQ communities are subject to. This report analyzes the different models and types of legislation being used in this area, and provides recommendations for legislative reform for hate crime.

International Association of Chiefs of Police: Law Enforcement Policy Center. (2021). *Investigation of hate crimes*. <a href="https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/2021-03/Hate%20Crimes%20Formatted%20201-03-23.pdf">https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/2021-03/Hate%20Crimes%20Formatted%20201-03-23.pdf</a>

Document that contains two types of articles created by the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP). First, it contains a model policy that is intended to guide and direct law enforcement agencies in identifying and investigating hate crimes and hate incidents, as well as assisting victimized populations. Second, it contains a concepts and issues paper which is intended to provide context and support the model policy by providing a greater understanding of the implementation requirements.

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. (2014). *Prosecuting hate crimes: A practical guide*. Warsaw, Poland: OSCE/ODIHR. https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/0/0/124532.pdf

A comprehensive guide published by the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe's (OSCE) Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) with assistance from the International Association of Prosecutors (IAP). This guide was designed as a tool to enhance the investigation and prosecution of hate crimes internationally and to develop organizational policies and training for law enforcement and prosecutors.

Sheridan, P., McInerny., & Kloss., G. (2015). A *prosecutor's stand: A guide for law enforcement*. US Department of Justice. https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-p308-pub.pdf

A guide intended for law enforcement engagement regarding hate crime prosecution. The guide is to be used alongside a screening of a documentary that explores the nature of hate crimes, such as challenges in reporting, investigating, and prosecuting them, as well as the unique victimization and trauma experienced by hate crime victims. The material within helps to facilitate engagement about these issues, and includes sample discussion questions, statistics and facts about hate crimes, supplemental resources, and an evaluation survey.

United Nations. (2020). *United Nations guidance note on addressing and countering COVID-19 related hate speech.* 

 $\frac{https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/Guidance\%20on\%20COVID-19\%}{20related\%20Hate\%20Speech.pdf}$ 

A guidance note published by the United Nations regarding the phenomenon of COVID-19 related hate speech towards a variety of ethnic and religious groups as well as medical and health care professionals, and how it is being exacerbated by use of media platforms. The note contains recommendations to UN departments, member states, social media and tech companies, media, as well as civil society and other stakeholders on how they can address and counteract COVID-19 related hate speech.

#### Association Articles

This section is compiled of materials from various organizations outside of Canada that discuss and address hate crime policy, research, and practices. Publications include policy and law reviews, journals, and position papers from a variety of agencies.

Chakraborti, N. (2016). Mind the gap! Making stronger connections between hate crime policy and scholarship. *Criminal Justice Policy Review*, *27*(6), 577-589. https://doi.org/10.1177/0887403415599641

An article focusing on the relationship between hate crime literature and policy formation and the gap that is preventing the successful implementation of such policies. The findings indicate that the policy and hate crime scholarship relationship is symbiotic and should link academic evidence and practitioner input.

Chakraborti, N & Hardy, S. (2015). LGB&T hate crime reporting: Identifying barriers and solutions. *Equality and Human Rights Commission UK*. https://www.tandis.odihr.pl/bitstream/20.500.12389/22287/1/08623.pdf

This article provides insight into specific victim populations, best practice for police, and rates of under-reporting. The study identifies barriers to reporting through interviews with a diverse group of participants who differ in ethnicity, age, residence, disability, gender, faith, and sexual orientation.

Fischer, M. (2021). Hate speech laws and blasphemy laws: Parallels show problems with the U.N. strategy and plan of action on hate speech. *Emory International Law Review*, 35(2), 177–218.

https://scholarlycommons.law.emory.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1254&context=eilr

Article that discusses the dangers posed to vulnerable populations by the U.N.'s Strategy and Plan of Action on Hate Speech; it acknowledges advocates of the human rights perspective and discusses the potential ramification of this strategy.

Garland, J. (2016). One step forward, two steps backward? Difficulties and dilemmas with connecting hate crime policy and research. *Criminal Justice Policy Review 27*(6) 627-639. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/0887403415601474">https://doi.org/10.1177/0887403415601474</a>

Article that assesses the issues preventing hate crime academics and practitioners from working together to generate guidelines and recommendations that inspire changes in practice. The suggestions and evidence in this article works to promote harmony and efficiency between scholars and practitioners in hate crime policy and research.

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary and Fire & Rescue Services. (2018). *Understanding the difference: The initial police response to hate crime*.

<a href="https://www.justiceinspectorates.gov.uk/hmicfrs/wp-content/uploads/understanding-the-difference-the-initial-police-response-to-hate-crime.pdf">https://www.justiceinspectorates.gov.uk/hmicfrs/wp-content/uploads/understanding-the-difference-the-initial-police-response-to-hate-crime.pdf</a>

Comprehensive report that analyzes how law enforcement agencies deal with hate crime incidents. The report found inconsistencies across agencies and within the agencies themselves, and that lack of accurate information about hate crimes makes it difficult for governments, police and crime commissioners, chief constables, and victim support groups to effectively respond to them. It offers several recommendations to improve police responses to hate crime and increase community trust.

Schweppe, J., Haynes, A., & MacIntosh, E. M. (2020). What is measured matters: The value of third party hate crime monitoring. *European Journal on Criminal Policy & Research*, 26(1), 39–59. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10610-018-9403-4

Authors collected data fulfilled by civil society organizations on the prevalence and motivations of hate crime within different jurisdictions, by use of third party monitoring. It is argued that civil society reporting systems provide a venue to challenge hegemonic constructions of hate crime, and the article recommends that international bodies provide support for these measures.

Tessler, H., Choi, M., & Kao, G. (2020). The anxiety of being Asian American: Hate crimes and negative biases during the COVID-19 pandemic. *American Journal Of Criminal Justice*, 45, 636. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12103-020-09541-5

Article that discusses how throughout history, Asian Americans have been viewed as being foreign no matter how long they have lived in North America, and that the COVID-19 pandemic has elevated incidents of hate and microaggressions towards the population. The authors contend that the recent surge in bias, hate crimes and vandalism could lead to a reawakening of a Asian American social and identity movement.

# Best Practices and Recommendations: Supporting Victim Needs and Improvement of Services

#### Canadian Publications

This section is compiled of empirical research that describes current discrepancies in hate crime literature, and makes recommendations for future research and policies in Canada. The publications are centred around supporting victims of hate crime, and improving the response from law enforcement agencies to combat hate crime.

Canadian Bar Association Committees. (2020). *Legal remedies for victims of hate speech*.

Canadian Bar Association. <a href="https://www.cba.org/CMSPages/GetFile.aspx?guid=a92e68a9-5338-471f-9694-9f0ef887ca05">https://www.cba.org/CMSPages/GetFile.aspx?guid=a92e68a9-5338-471f-9694-9f0ef887ca05</a>

This report is in response to Justice Canada's consultation paper of July 2020. The paper offers recommendations for civil and criminal remedies for combating hate speech. Recommendations also include ways for the police and public to address the gap in data collection and tracking online hate.

Department of Justice. Government of Canada. (2015). *An exploration of the needs of victims of hate crimes*. <a href="https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/cj-jp/victim/rr07\_vic1/p5.html">https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/cj-jp/victim/rr07\_vic1/p5.html</a>

Publication from the Department of Justice in Canada that provides suggestions for future research, training, education, and improvements to current services through training, as well as reducing barriers and accessibility issues for victims of hate crime. The publication concludes that Canada does not have well developed literature on the victims of hate crimes, and is in need of more thorough research.

Erentzen, C., & Schuller, R. (2020). Exploring the dark figure of hate: Experiences with police bias and the under-reporting of hate crime. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice*, 62(2) 64-97. https://doi.org/10.3138/cjccj.2019-0035

Research article that explores possible factors contributing to the under-reporting of hate crime in Canada and evaluates the complex nature of victimization, police report statistics, and discrimination on the basis of identity.

Mercier-Dalphond, G., & Helly, D. (2021). Anti-Muslim violence, hate crime, and victimization in Canada: A study of five canadian cities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal*, *53*(1), 1. doi:10.1353/ces.2021.0000

A study that reviews the testimonies of Canadian Muslims across Quebec City, Montreal, Toronto, Edmonton, and Vancouver with the goal of investigating both the manifestations and the impact of hate crimes against Canadian Muslisms and to identify aspects of victimization towards this population.

- Omatsu, M., Yee, G., Chan., G & Westmoreland, J. (n.d.). Responding to hate toolkit: Combat anti-asian racism by taking action. <a href="https://www.ryerson.ca/content/dam/responding-to-hate/responding-to-hate/responding-to-hate-toolkit-brochure-8.5x11.pdf">https://www.ryerson.ca/content/dam/responding-to-hate/responding-to-hate/responding-to-hate-toolkit-brochure-8.5x11.pdf</a>
- Perry, B. & Samuels-Wortley, K. (2021). "We're not where we should be": Enhancing law enforcement responses to hate crime. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice*, 63(2), 68-98. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3138/cjccj.2020-0057">https://doi.org/10.3138/cjccj.2020-0057</a>

Study that aims to address how law enforcement responds to and acts on hate crime in Ontario. Includes interviews with eight different jurisdictions of law enforcement in Ontario and uncovered three different factor types that affect how hate crime is managed: environmental, organizational, and individual.

Public Safety Canada. (2006). *Addressing hate crimes in Ontario: Strategy recommendations priorities for action*. <a href="https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/lbrr/archives/cnmcs-plcng/cn29799-eng.pdf">https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/lbrr/archives/cnmcs-plcng/cn29799-eng.pdf</a>

Comprehensive report to the Attorney General and the Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services about strategies to detect, reduce, and redress hate crime, as well as addressing the needs and interests of vulnerable individuals and communities in Ontario. There is emphasis that the historical and social context of systemic bias has over time allowed hate crime to appear permissible.

The University of British Columbia. (2021). *The national forum on anti-Asian racism: Final report*. <a href="https://lxo9v2454s83rop493krft92-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/UBC-National-Forum-Anti-Asian-Racism-Report\_18-Oct-2021\_web.pdf">https://lxo9v2454s83rop493krft92-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/UBC-National-Forum-Anti-Asian-Racism-Report\_18-Oct-2021\_web.pdf</a>

This report summarizes the events of the National Forum on Anti-Asian racism and Student Dialogue held in June 2021. With input from 126 panelists and more than 2000 students, the report emphasizes eight major topic areas of discussion: Health; Justice System; Representation in Media and Culture; Issues in Housing, Social Services and Elder Care; Government, Policy and Political Representation; Economic Issues; Coalition

Building; Education. The report also provides suggested readings, projects and general information about relevant community organizations.

### Publications Outside of Canada

This section is compiled of empirical research that describes current discrepancies in hate crime literature, and makes recommendations for future research and policies outside of Canada. The publications are centred around supporting victims of hate crime, improving the response from law enforcement agencies to combat hate crime.

Community Security Trust. (2017). *Hate crime: A guide for those affected*. <a href="https://cst.org.uk/data/file/a/4/Hate%20Crime%20-%20A%20guide%20for%20those%20affected.1503330449.pdf">https://cst.org.uk/data/file/a/4/Hate%20Crime%20-%20A%20guide%20for%20those%20affected.1503330449.pdf</a>

Guide that is intended to support victims of hate crimes. It assists navigating through the police investigation, reporting, and court processes, as well as identifying support services. The guide offers definitions of justice system terminology, as well as hate crime, antisemitism, and anti-muslim hatred, and can help victims to identify what types of hate crimes exist.

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (2016). *Ensuring justice for hate crime victims:*\*Professional perspectives. <a href="https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\_uploads/fra-2016-justice-hate\_crime-victims\_en.pdf">https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\_uploads/fra-2016-justice-hate\_crime-victims\_en.pdf</a>

Report that addresses challenges encountered by actors in the criminal justice system in applying the concepts of hate crime, how underreporting of hate crime impairs criminal justice system's responses to it, the role of the police in encouraging victims to report hate crime, as well as their role in recording and investigating it. The report also discusses lack of trust in police organizations and offers some suggestions on how to remedy this, as well as describing the necessities to developing effective policy against hate crime.

Hardy, S.-J., Chakraborti, N., & Cuko, I. (2020). More than a tick-box? The role of training in improving police responses to hate crime. *British Journal of Community Justice*, *16*(1), 4.https://www.mmuperu.co.uk/bjcj/articles/more-than-a-tick-box-the-role-of-training-in-improving-police-responses-to

This article highlights that existing hate crime training in police forces is being hindered by structural, organizational, operational, and individual barriers, all of which impact it's effectiveness and implementation. The authors offer recommendations for improving existing training so that police organizations are able to meet the needs of diverse, vulnerable communities.

Mitchell, K. J., Jones, L. M., Turner, H. A., Hamby, S., Farrell, A., Cuevas, C., & Daly, B. (2020). Exposure to multiple forms of bias victimization on youth and young adults: Relationships with trauma symptomatology and social support. *Journal of Youth & Adolescence*, 49(10), 1961–1975. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10964-020-01304-z

Study exploring relationships between exposure to bias-motivated victimization, trauma symptoms, and social supports. Findings echo previous research, displaying the adverse

mental health effects of belonging to multiple marginalized groups and how experiencing hate and bias impacts the well-being and feelings of support among victims.

National Center for Hate Crime Prevention Education and Development Center (2000).

Responding to hate crime: A multidisciplinary curriculum for law enforcement and victim assistance professionals.

https://www.ncjrs.gov/ovc\_archives/reports/responding/files/ncj182290.pdf

A comprehensive curriculum manual designed to train law enforcement and victim assistance professionals in responding to hate crime. The manual intends to provide these actors with the skills to better respond to victims of hate crime, and to work with other organizations more effectively.

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. (2020). *Hate crime victims in the criminal justice system: A practical guide*. Warsaw, Poland: OSCE/ODIHR. https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/c/5/447028.pdf

This comprehensive guide was designed to establish best practices for hate crime victim support and is intended to be used by support practitioners, criminal justice officials and policy makers. It introduces 42 recommendations and 10 practical steps to provide an effective system of support for hate crime victims.

Swadling, Napoli-Rangel, & Imran (2015). *Hate crime: Barriers to reporting and best practices*. University of York Centre for Applied Human Rights.

<a href="https://www.yorkhumanrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/Hate-Crime-Report-Final.pdf">https://www.yorkhumanrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/Hate-Crime-Report-Final.pdf</a>

This report covers practical barriers of hate crime and incident reporting such as language, education, and access, as well as the social and structural barriers such as historical trauma, structural oppression, and disempowerment. The report also offers an extensive list of strategies to improve hate crime reporting, which includes education, victimization surveys, legal empowerment, and hate incident reporting centres.

Wu, C., Qian, Y., & Wilkes, R. (2021). Anti-Asian discrimination and the Asian-white mental health gap during COVID-19. *Ethnic & Racial Studies*, 44(5), 819–835. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2020.1851739

This article considers how the influx of anti-Asian hate crimes, paired with the COVID-19 pandemic, may be disproportionately impacting the mental health of Asians. It analyzes pandemic related discrimination and argues that increased prevalence of anti-Asian hate crimes provide one explanation for the inordinate mental health impact for this community.